



**International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda**  
**Tribunal pénal international pour le Rwanda**

---

**IN TRIAL CHAMBER I**

**Before:** Judge Erik MØSE, President  
Judge Jai Ram REDDY  
Judge Sergei Alekseevich EGOROV

**Registrar:** Adama Dieng

**Date:** 23 April 2007 / 24 May 2007

**THE PROSECUTOR**

v.

**Théoneste BAGOSORA**  
**Gratien KABILIGI**  
**Anatole NSENGIYUMVA**  
**Aloys NTABAKUZE**

*Case No: ICTR-98-41-T*

---

**MAJOR ALOYS NTABAKUZE**  
**AMENDED**  
**FINAL TRIAL BRIEF**

---

**Counsel for the Prosecution**

Barbara MULVANEY  
Drew WHITE  
Christine GRAHAM  
Rashid RASHID

**Counsel for Ntabakuze**

Peter ERLINDER  
Marc NERENBERG

**Other Defence Counsel**

Raphaël CONSTANT  
Allison TURNER  
Paul SKOLNIK  
Frédéric HIVON  
Kennedy OGETTO  
Gershom Otachi BW'OMANWA

**PUBLIC REDACTED VERSION**

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

<b>PART ONE: INTRODUCTION.....</b>	<b>8</b>
<b>THE CHARGES BY PROSECUTION HAVE NOT BEEN PROVEN BEYOND ALL REASONABLE DOUBT</b>	<b>8</b>
<b>PART TWO: THE LAW.....</b>	<b>12</b>
<b>I. APPLICABLE LAW TO INDICTMENTS.....</b>	<b>12</b>
<b>II. OTHER LEGAL ISSUES.....</b>	<b>21</b>
<i>A. THE STANDARD OF PROOF: EXPOSITION ON REASONABLE DOUBT.....</i>	<i>21</i>
<i>B. THE PERSUASIVE VALUE OF CIRCUMSTANTIAL EVIDENCE.....</i>	<i>26</i>
<i>C. BURDEN AND STANDARD OF PROOF IN RELATION TO ALIBI.....</i>	<i>27</i>
<i>D. DIRECT RESPONSIBILITY.....</i>	<i>28</i>
<i>E. COMMAND RESPONSIBILITY.....</i>	<i>30</i>
<i>F. ADMISSIBILITY ISSUES AND PURPOSES FOR WHICH CERTAIN EVIDENCE CAN BE USED.....</i>	<i>35</i>
<i>G. WEIGHT ISSUES.....</i>	<i>37</i>
<b>PART THREE: EVIDENCE.....</b>	<b>41</b>
<b>I. CREDIBILITY OF WITNESSES.....</b>	<b>41</b>
<i>A. CREDIBILITY OF DEFENCE WITNESSES.....</i>	<i>41</i>
<b>Introduction.....</b>	<b>41</b>
<b>Diplomatic and Political Witnesses.....</b>	<b>42</b>
1. <i>Witness DM-25.....</i>	<i>42</i>
2. <i>Flaten: U. S. Ambassador to Rwanda, Robert Flaten.....</i>	<i>44</i>
3. <i>Former RPF Foreign Minister Jean Marie Vianney Ndagijimana.....</i>	<i>45</i>
4. <i>United Nations SRSG Mr. Roger Booh-Booh.....</i>	<i>46</i>
<b>Senior European and UNAMIR Military Officers.....</b>	<b>47</b>
5. <i>Witness DM-26.....</i>	<i>47</i>
6. <i>UNAMIR Belgian Col. Luc Marchal.....</i>	<i>48</i>
7. <i>Belgian Lt. Col. Jacques Duvivier.....</i>	<i>49</i>
8. <i>UNAMIR Belgian Col. Dewez.....</i>	<i>50</i>
9. <i>Dutch UNAMIR Major Robert Van Putten.....</i>	<i>51</i>
10. <i>UNAMIR Capt Amadou Deme: Testified via 92 bis.....</i>	<i>52</i>
<b>Former ICTR-OTP: Defence Witnesses.....</b>	<b>53</b>
11. <i>QC Micheal Hourigan: Testimony via 92 bis.....</i>	<i>53</i>
<i>Amadou Deme.....</i>	<i>53</i>

<b>Eye-Witnesses</b> .....	54
12. <i>Witness DH-90</i> .....	54
13. <i>Witness DH-91</i> .....	55
14. <i>Witness DH-133</i> .....	56
<b>Rwandan Civilian Witnesses</b> .....	57
15. <i>Witness DH-67</i> .....	57
16. <i>Witness DI-43</i> .....	58
17. <i>Witness L-22</i> .....	58
18. <i>Witness DI-40</i> .....	59
19. <i>Witness LM-1</i> .....	60
20. <i>Witness NR-1</i> .....	61
<b>Former RPA/F Officers and Members</b> .....	62
21. <i>Former RPA/F Lt. Abdul Joshua Ruzibiza</i> .....	62
22. <i>Witness BRA-1</i> .....	63
23. <i>Witness ALL-42</i> .....	64
24. <i>Witness LX-1</i> .....	64
<b>Officers of the ex-Rwandan Army (AR)</b> .....	66
25. <i>Witness DK-32</i> .....	66
26. <i>Witness DM-191</i> .....	67
27. <i>Witness DM-190</i> .....	67
28. <i>Witness DM-52</i> .....	68
29. <i>Witness DI-35</i> .....	69
30. <i>Witness DI-37</i> .....	70
31. <i>Witness A-04</i> .....	70
32. <i>Witness LIG-1</i> .....	71
<b>Officer &amp; NCO of the ex-National Gendarmerie</b> .....	72
33. <i>Witness DK-60</i> .....	72
34. <i>Witness DK-37</i> .....	72
<b>Non-commissioned Officers of the ex-Rwandan Army (AR)</b> .....	74
35. <i>Witness DK-11</i> .....	74
36. <i>Witness DH-85</i> .....	74
37. <i>Witness NATO-1</i> .....	75
38. <i>Witness DK-27</i> .....	76
39. <i>Witness DK-19</i> .....	76
40. <i>Witness DH-68</i> .....	77
41. <i>Witness X-06</i> .....	78
<b>Enlisted Personnel of the ex-Rwandan Army (AR)</b> .....	79
42. <i>Witness DH-87</i> .....	79
43. <i>Witness DK-14</i> .....	79
44. <i>Witness DK-110</i> .....	80
45. <i>Witness DK-120</i> .....	81
46. <i>Witness DH-51</i> .....	82
<b>Expert witnesses</b> .....	83
47. <i>Father Serge Desouter</i> .....	83
48. <i>Professor Bernard Lugan</i> .....	84
49. <i>Dr. Helmut Strizek</i> .....	84
<b>B. THE CREDIBILITY OF SIGNIFICANT PROSECUTION WITNESSES, AS THEIR TESTIMONY RELATED TO THE OTP CASE AGAINST MAJOR NTABAKUZE</b> .....	86
<b>Preface</b> .....	86
1. <b>Prosecution witness XAB</b> .....	87
2. <b>Prosecution witness DBQ</b> .....	91
3. <b>Prosecution witness DCH</b> .....	101
4. <b>Prosecution witness LN</b> .....	103
5. <b>Prosecution witness XAP</b> .....	107
6. <b>Prosecution witness DBN</b> .....	110
7. <b>Prosecution witness XAI</b> .....	113
8. <b>Prosecution witness XAQ</b> .....	117
9. <b>Prosecution witness XXY</b> .....	121
10. <b>Prosecution witness AAA</b> .....	124

11. Prosecution witness AH .....	127
12. Prosecution witness WB .....	131
CONCLUSION .....	137
<b>II. ALTERNATIVE EXPLANATION OF THE TRAGIC EVENTS IN RWANDA DURING THE FOUR YEAR WAR .....</b>	<b>138</b>
1. INTRODUCTION .....	139
2. THE BURUNDI-PRECEDENT .....	140
3. THE WAR IN RWANDA .....	141
4. GEN. KAGAME TRIGGERS THE PREDICTED CIVILIAN MASSACRES .....	144
5. CONTINUING AND DEEPENING THE PREDICTED BLOODBATH .....	145
6. CHRONOLOGICAL LISTING OF PROSECUTION AND OF DEFENSE DOCUMENTARY EXHIBITS/TESTIMONY DESCRIBING THE ALTERNATIVE EXPLANATION OF EVENTS DURING THE 1990-94 RWANDA WAR: .....	149
<b>III. THE ACCUSED AND THE PARA COMMANDO BATTALION .....</b>	<b>175</b>
1. BACKGROUND .....	175
2. THE EVENTS AS EXPERIENCED BY THE ACCUSED .....	181
<b>IV. MAP OF KIGALI TOWN (RESIZED) MARKED BY MAJOR NTABAKUZE: EXHIBIT DNT228 ....</b>	<b>186</b>
<b>V. MAP OF RWANDA (RESIZED) MARKED BY MAJOR NTABAKUZE: EXHIBIT DNT229 .....</b>	<b>187</b>
<b>VI. ANALYSIS OF EACH OF THE PROSECUTION’S ALLEGATIONS .....</b>	<b>188</b>
INTRODUCTION .....	188
ALLEGATIONS PRIOR TO 6 APRIL 1994 .....	193
1. ALLEGATIONS ABOUT THE ARREST OF PEOPLE IN OCTOBER 1990 USING LISTS .....	194
2. THE ‘DEFINITION OF THE ENEMY’ .....	207
3. ALLEGATIONS OF DISCRIMINATION AGAINST TUTSI WITHIN THE PARACOMMANDOS .....	227
4. ALLEGATIONS ABOUT DEATH SQUADS: AMASASU AND OTHER RELATED ORGANIZATIONS .....	234
5. ALLEGATIONS ABOUT CONSPIRACY AT A BUTOTORI MEETING AND OTHER MEETINGS BEFORE 06 APRIL 1994 .....	248
6. ALLEGATIONS OF TRAINING OF MILITIAS .....	263
7. ALLEGATION OF MAJOR NTABAKUZE’S OPPOSITION TO THE ARUSHA ACCORDS .....	273
APRIL 6, 1994 .....	284
8. ALLEGATIONS OF PHYSICAL PRESENCE AT A GENERAL ASSEMBLY ON 6 OR 7 APRIL 1994 AND PHYSICALLY COMMITTING CRIMINAL ACTS, BY UTTERING ORDERS TO HARM CIVILIANS .....	286
9. ALLEGATIONS ABOUT MEETINGS BETWEEN MAJOR NTABAKUZE, COLONEL BAGOSORA AND OTHER OFFICERS AT CAMP KANOMBE AFTER THE CRASH OF THE PRESIDENTIAL PLANE .....	335
10. ALLEGATIONS ABOUT THE AKAJAGALI INCIDENT .....	356
APRIL 7, 1994 .....	387
11. ALLEGATIONS ABOUT KIMIHURURA INCIDENTS .....	390

12. ALLEGATIONS ABOUT KILLING AT CENTRE CHRISTUS.....	401
13. CONSPIRACY: ALLEGATIONS ABOUT BAGOSORA ORDERING “MUHERE ARUHANDE”.....	410
14. ALLEGATIONS ABOUT THE NZABONARIBA INCIDENT.....	417
15. ALLEGATIONS ABOUT ROADBLOCKS.....	428
16. ALLEGATIONS ABOUT INCIDENTS IN REMERA AND ENVIRONS.....	439
APRIL 7- MAY 21, 1994.....	451
17. ALLEGATIONS ABOUT SUPPLYING WEAPONS AND AMMUNITION TO THE INTERAHAMWE.....	453
18. ALLEGATIONS ABOUT KABEZA.....	474
19. ALLEGATIONS RELATING TO KABEZA I.....	486
20. ALLEGATIONS ABOUT KILLINGS IN KABUGA.....	492
21. ALLEGATIONS ABOUT THE SONATUBE ‘INCIDENTS’.....	502
22. ALLEGATIONS ABOUT THE NYABYENDA INCIDENT.....	527
23. ALLEGATIONS ABOUT KILLINGS IN KICUKIRO AND SAHARA.....	533
24. ALLEGATIONS ABOUT KILLINGS AT RUHANGA CHURCH.....	537
25. ALLEGATIONS ABOUT THE IAMSEA INCIDENT.....	544
26. UTTERANCE OVER THE DEAD BODY OF PRIME MINISTER AGATHE.....	564
27. ALLEGATIONS ABOUT THE KILLINGS AT MASAKA.....	569
28. ALLEGATIONS RELATING TO KABGAYI HOSPITAL IN GITARAMA.....	577
MAY 21 – JULY 17, 1994.....	592
29. ALLEGATIONS ABOUT KILLINGS IN KABUSUNZU SECTOR.....	595
30. ALLEGATIONS ABOUT KILLINGS IN NYAKABANDA SECTOR.....	605
31. ALLEGATIONS ABOUT RWAMPARA INCIDENT.....	615
32. ALLEGATIONS ABOUT RAPE.....	624
33. ALLEGATION ABOUT REINFORCING INTERAHAMWE IN GITARAMA, KIBUYE AND NGORORERO.....	632
34. ALLEGATIONS ABOUT PLANNING OF GUERRILLA WARFARE.....	640
VII. ANALYSIS OF DNT EXHIBITS.....	643
VIII. CONCLUSION ON EVIDENCE.....	678
<b>PART FOUR: RESPONSE TO THE PROSECUTION BRIEF.....</b>	<b>681</b>
I. INTRODUCTION.....	681
II. DEFENSE RESPONSE TO PARAGRAPHS REFERRING TO MAJOR NTABAKUZE IN “CHAPTER IV” OF THE PROSECUTION BRIEF (IV. EVIDENCE ON VARIOUS COUNTS).....	682
III. DEFENSE RESPONSE TO PARAGRAPHS IN “CHAPTER V” OF THE PROSECUTION BRIEF REFERRING OR AFFECTING MAJ NTABAKUZE (V. EVIDENCE ON VARIOUS TOPICS).....	690
IV. DEFENCE RESPONSE TO SELECTED PARAGRAPHS REFERENCING SPECIFIC EXHIBITS IN “CHAPTER VI” OF THE PROSECUTION BRIEF (VI. EVIDENCE IN VARIOUS EXHIBITS).....	707
V. LIST OF EXCLUDED EVIDENCE INAPPROPRIATELY MENTIONED IN THE PROSECUTOR’S FINAL TRIAL BRIEF.....	713

**PART FIVE: ANALYSIS OF THE PARAGRAPHS OF THE INDICTMENT WHICH PURPOTEDLY SUPPORT THE COUNTS .....714**

**I. THE CHARGES ..... 714**

**II. ANALYSIS OF THE RELEVANT PARAGRAPHS OF THE INDICTMENT ..... 716**

**A. PARAGRAPHS OF THE INDICTMENT PURPORTEDLY SUPPORTING COUNTS 1 TO 5 AND 7 TO 9 PURSUANT TO ARTICLE 6 (1)..... 716**

Paragraph 4.6 of the Indictment: ..... 716

Paragraph 4.7 of the Indictment: ..... 716

Paragraph 4.8 of the Indictment: ..... 717

Paragraph 5.1 of the Indictment: ..... 717

Paragraph 5.5 of the Indictment: ..... 719

Paragraph 5.8 of the Indictment: ..... 720

Paragraph 5.10 of the Indictment: ..... 721

Paragraph 5.16 of the Indictment: ..... 722

Paragraph 5.17 of the Indictment: ..... 723

Paragraph 5.22 of the Indictment: ..... 724

Paragraph 6.7 of the Indictment: ..... 725

Paragraph 6.8 of the Indictment: ..... 725

Paragraph 6.18 of the Indictment: ..... 728

Paragraph 6.24 of the Indictment: ..... 729

Paragraph 6.27 of the Indictment: ..... 730

Paragraph 6.28 of the Indictment: ..... 732

Paragraph 6.29 of the Indictment: ..... 733

Paragraph 6.30 of the Indictment: ..... 733

Paragraph 6.31 of the Indictment: ..... 733

Paragraph 6.46 of the Indictment: ..... 734

Paragraph 6.49 of the Indictment: ..... 735

Paragraph 6.50 of the Indictment: ..... 735

Paragraph 6.51 of the indictment: ..... 737

**B. PARAGRAPHS OF THE INDICTMENT PURPORTEDLY SUPPORTING COUNTS 1 TO 5 AND 7 TO 9 PURSUANT TO RULE 6 (3) ..... 738**

Paragraph 5.33 of the Indictment: ..... 738

Paragraph 5.34 of the Indictment: ..... 738

Paragraph 5.35 of the Indictment: ..... 738

Paragraph 5.36 of the Indictment: ..... 739

Paragraph 6.8 of the Indictment: ..... 741

Paragraph 6.15 of the Indictment: ..... 743

Paragraph 6.16 of the Indictment: ..... 744

Paragraph 6.18 of the Indictment: ..... 744

Paragraph 6.19 of the Indictment: ..... 746

Paragraph 6.32 of the Indictment: ..... 747

Paragraph 6.33 of the Indictment: ..... 748

Paragraph 6.34 of the Indictment: ..... 749

Paragraph 6.35 of the Indictment: ..... 750

Paragraph 6.36 of the Indictment: ..... 750

Paragraph 6.37 of the indictment: ..... 751

Paragraph 6.38 of the Indictment: ..... 753

Paragraph 6.39 of the Indictment: ..... 754

Paragraph 6.41 of the Indictment: ..... 755

Paragraph 6.44 of the indictment: ..... 755

Paragraph 6.45 of the Indictment: ..... 756

Paragraph 6.47 of the indictment: ..... 757

Paragraph 6.51 of the indictment: ..... 758

**C. PARAGRAPHS OF THE INDICTMENT PURPORTEDLY SUPPORTING COUNTS 6 AND 10 PURSUANT TO RULE 6 (3) ..... 760**

Paragraph 4.6 of the Indictment: .....	760
Paragraph 4.7 of the Indictment: .....	760
Paragraph 4.8 of the Indictment: .....	760
Paragraph 5.36 of the Indictment: .....	761
Paragraph 6.8 of the Indictment: .....	762
Paragraph 6.42 of the Indictment: .....	763
Paragraph 6.47 of the indictment: .....	764

III. CONCLUSION .....	766
-----------------------	-----

## **PART SIX: THE COUNTS.....767**

COUNT 1: CONSPIRACY TO COMMIT GENOCIDE .....	767
COUNT 2: GENOCIDE .....	771
COUNT 3: COMPLICITY IN GENOCIDE .....	778
COUNT 4: CRIME AGAINST HUMANITY: MURDER .....	783
COUNT 5: CRIME AGAINST HUMANITY: EXTERMINATION .....	786
COUNT 7: CRIME AGAINST HUMANITY: PERSECUTION .....	791
COUNT 8: CRIME AGAINST HUMANITY: INHUMANE ACTS .....	793
COUNT 9: SERIOUS VIOLATION OF ARTICLE 3 COMMON TO THE GENEVA CONVENTIONS AND ADDITIONAL PROTOCOL II: .....	796
COUNT 10: SERIOUS VIOLATION OF ARTICLE 3 COMMON TO THE GENEVA CONVENTIONS AND ADDITIONAL PROTOCOL II: .....	798

## **PART SEVEN: SENTENCING ISSUES:.....801**

I. PRELIMINARY REMARK .....	801
II. THE GOOD CHARACTER OF THE ACCUSED .....	801
III. PREJUDICE CAUSED BY PRE-TRIAL PROCEEDINGS .....	802

## **PART EIGHT: GENERAL CONCLUSION .....810**

## **ANNEX: NTABAKUZE DEPOSITION IN SEPTEMBER 2006 .....811**