



International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda
Tribunal pénal international pour le Rwanda

IN TRIAL CHAMBER I

Before: Judge Erik MØSE, President
Judge Jai Ram REDDY
Judge Sergei Alekseevich EGOROV

Registrar: Adama Dieng

Date: 23 April 2007 / 24 May 2007

THE PROSECUTOR

v.

Théoneste BAGOSORA
Gratien KABILIGI
Anatole NSENGIYUMVA
Aloys NTABAKUZE

Case No: ICTR-98-41-T

MAJOR ALOYS NTABAKUZE
AMENDED
FINAL TRIAL BRIEF

Counsel for the Prosecution

Barbara MULVANEY
Drew WHITE
Christine GRAHAM
Rashid RASHID

Counsel for Ntabakuze

Peter ERLINDER
Marc NERENBERG

Other Defence Counsel

Raphaël CONSTANT
Allison TURNER
Paul SKOLNIK
Frédéric HIVON
Kennedy OGETTO
Gershom Otachi BW'OMANWA

PUBLIC REDACTED VERSION

TABLE OF CONTENTS

PART ONE: INTRODUCTION.....	8
THE CHARGES BY PROSECUTION HAVE NOT BEEN PROVEN BEYOND ALL REASONABLE DOUBT	
PART TWO: THE LAW.....	12
I. APPLICABLE LAW TO INDICTMENTS.....	12
II. OTHER LEGAL ISSUES.....	21
<i>A. THE STANDARD OF PROOF: EXPOSITION ON REASONABLE DOUBT.....</i>	<i>21</i>
<i>B. THE PERSUASIVE VALUE OF CIRCUMSTANTIAL EVIDENCE.....</i>	<i>26</i>
<i>C. BURDEN AND STANDARD OF PROOF IN RELATION TO ALIBI.....</i>	<i>27</i>
<i>D. DIRECT RESPONSIBILITY.....</i>	<i>28</i>
<i>E. COMMAND RESPONSIBILITY.....</i>	<i>30</i>
<i>F. ADMISSIBILITY ISSUES AND PURPOSES FOR WHICH CERTAIN EVIDENCE CAN BE USED.....</i>	<i>35</i>
<i>G. WEIGHT ISSUES.....</i>	<i>37</i>
PART THREE: EVIDENCE.....	41
I. CREDIBILITY OF WITNESSES.....	41
<i>A. CREDIBILITY OF DEFENCE WITNESSES.....</i>	<i>41</i>
Introduction.....	41
Diplomatic and Political Witnesses.....	42
1. <i>Witness DM-25.....</i>	<i>42</i>
2. <i>Flaten: U. S. Ambassador to Rwanda, Robert Flaten.....</i>	<i>44</i>
3. <i>Former RPF Foreign Minister Jean Marie Vianney Ndagijimana.....</i>	<i>45</i>
4. <i>United Nations SRSG Mr. Roger Booh-Booh.....</i>	<i>46</i>
Senior European and UNAMIR Military Officers.....	47
5. <i>Witness DM-26.....</i>	<i>47</i>
6. <i>UNAMIR Belgian Col. Luc Marchal.....</i>	<i>48</i>
7. <i>Belgian Lt. Col. Jacques Duvivier.....</i>	<i>49</i>
8. <i>UNAMIR Belgian Col. Dewez.....</i>	<i>50</i>
9. <i>Dutch UNAMIR Major Robert Van Putten.....</i>	<i>51</i>
10. <i>UNAMIR Capt Amadou Deme: Testified via 92 bis.....</i>	<i>52</i>
Former ICTR-OTP: Defence Witnesses.....	53
11. <i>QC Micheal Hourigan: Testimony via 92 bis.....</i>	<i>53</i>
<i>Amadou Deme.....</i>	<i>53</i>

Eye-Witnesses	54
12. <i>Witness DH-90</i>	54
13. <i>Witness DH-91</i>	55
14. <i>Witness DH-133</i>	56
Rwandan Civilian Witnesses	57
15. <i>Witness DH-67</i>	57
16. <i>Witness DI-43</i>	58
17. <i>Witness L-22</i>	58
18. <i>Witness DI-40</i>	59
19. <i>Witness LM-1</i>	60
20. <i>Witness NR-1</i>	61
Former RPA/F Officers and Members	62
21. <i>Former RPA/F Lt. Abdul Joshua Ruzibiza</i>	62
22. <i>Witness BRA-1</i>	63
23. <i>Witness ALL-42</i>	64
24. <i>Witness LX-1</i>	64
Officers of the ex-Rwandan Army (AR)	66
25. <i>Witness DK-32</i>	66
26. <i>Witness DM-191</i>	67
27. <i>Witness DM-190</i>	67
28. <i>Witness DM-52</i>	68
29. <i>Witness DI-35</i>	69
30. <i>Witness DI-37</i>	70
31. <i>Witness A-04</i>	70
32. <i>Witness LIG-1</i>	71
Officer & NCO of the ex-National Gendarmerie	72
33. <i>Witness DK-60</i>	72
34. <i>Witness DK-37</i>	72
Non-commissioned Officers of the ex-Rwandan Army (AR)	74
35. <i>Witness DK-11</i>	74
36. <i>Witness DH-85</i>	74
37. <i>Witness NATO-1</i>	75
38. <i>Witness DK-27</i>	76
39. <i>Witness DK-19</i>	76
40. <i>Witness DH-68</i>	77
41. <i>Witness X-06</i>	78
Enlisted Personnel of the ex-Rwandan Army (AR)	79
42. <i>Witness DH-87</i>	79
43. <i>Witness DK-14</i>	79
44. <i>Witness DK-110</i>	80
45. <i>Witness DK-120</i>	81
46. <i>Witness DH-51</i>	82
Expert witnesses	83
47. <i>Father Serge Desouter</i>	83
48. <i>Professor Bernard Lugan</i>	84
49. <i>Dr. Helmut Strizek</i>	84
B. THE CREDIBILITY OF SIGNIFICANT PROSECUTION WITNESSES, AS THEIR TESTIMONY RELATED TO THE OTP CASE AGAINST MAJOR NTABAKUZE	86
Preface	86
1. Prosecution witness XAB	87
2. Prosecution witness DBQ	91
3. Prosecution witness DCH	101
4. Prosecution witness LN	103
5. Prosecution witness XAP	107
6. Prosecution witness DBN	110
7. Prosecution witness XAI	113
8. Prosecution witness XAQ	117
9. Prosecution witness XXY	121
10. Prosecution witness AAA	124

11. Prosecution witness AH	127
12. Prosecution witness WB	131
CONCLUSION	137
II. ALTERNATIVE EXPLANATION OF THE TRAGIC EVENTS IN RWANDA DURING THE FOUR YEAR WAR	138
1. INTRODUCTION	139
2. THE BURUNDI-PRECEDENT	140
3. THE WAR IN RWANDA	141
4. GEN. KAGAME TRIGGERS THE PREDICTED CIVILIAN MASSACRES	144
5. CONTINUING AND DEEPENING THE PREDICTED BLOODBATH	145
6. CHRONOLOGICAL LISTING OF PROSECUTION AND OF DEFENSE DOCUMENTARY EXHIBITS/TESTIMONY DESCRIBING THE ALTERNATIVE EXPLANATION OF EVENTS DURING THE 1990-94 RWANDA WAR:	149
III. THE ACCUSED AND THE PARA COMMANDO BATTALION	175
1. BACKGROUND	175
2. THE EVENTS AS EXPERIENCED BY THE ACCUSED	181
IV. MAP OF KIGALI TOWN (RESIZED) MARKED BY MAJOR NTABAKUZE: EXHIBIT DNT228	186
V. MAP OF RWANDA (RESIZED) MARKED BY MAJOR NTABAKUZE: EXHIBIT DNT229	187
VI. ANALYSIS OF EACH OF THE PROSECUTION’S ALLEGATIONS	188
INTRODUCTION	188
ALLEGATIONS PRIOR TO 6 APRIL 1994	193
1. ALLEGATIONS ABOUT THE ARREST OF PEOPLE IN OCTOBER 1990 USING LISTS	194
2. THE ‘DEFINITION OF THE ENEMY’	207
3. ALLEGATIONS OF DISCRIMINATION AGAINST TUTSI WITHIN THE PARACOMMANDOS	227
4. ALLEGATIONS ABOUT DEATH SQUADS: AMASASU AND OTHER RELATED ORGANIZATIONS	234
5. ALLEGATIONS ABOUT CONSPIRACY AT A BUTOTORI MEETING AND OTHER MEETINGS BEFORE 06 APRIL 1994	248
6. ALLEGATIONS OF TRAINING OF MILITIAS	263
7. ALLEGATION OF MAJOR NTABAKUZE’S OPPOSITION TO THE ARUSHA ACCORDS	273
APRIL 6, 1994	284
8. ALLEGATIONS OF PHYSICAL PRESENCE AT A GENERAL ASSEMBLY ON 6 OR 7 APRIL 1994 AND PHYSICALLY COMMITTING CRIMINAL ACTS, BY UTTERING ORDERS TO HARM CIVILIANS	286
9. ALLEGATIONS ABOUT MEETINGS BETWEEN MAJOR NTABAKUZE, COLONEL BAGOSORA AND OTHER OFFICERS AT CAMP KANOMBE AFTER THE CRASH OF THE PRESIDENTIAL PLANE	335
10. ALLEGATIONS ABOUT THE AKAJAGALI INCIDENT	356
APRIL 7, 1994	387
11. ALLEGATIONS ABOUT KIMIHURURA INCIDENTS	390

12. ALLEGATIONS ABOUT KILLING AT CENTRE CHRISTUS.....	401
13. CONSPIRACY: ALLEGATIONS ABOUT BAGOSORA ORDERING “MUHERE ARUHANDE”.....	410
14. ALLEGATIONS ABOUT THE NZABONARIBA INCIDENT.....	417
15. ALLEGATIONS ABOUT ROADBLOCKS.....	428
16. ALLEGATIONS ABOUT INCIDENTS IN REMERA AND ENVIRONS.....	439
APRIL 7- MAY 21, 1994.....	451
17. ALLEGATIONS ABOUT SUPPLYING WEAPONS AND AMMUNITION TO THE INTERAHAMWE.....	453
18. ALLEGATIONS ABOUT KABEZA.....	474
19. ALLEGATIONS RELATING TO KABEZA I.....	486
20. ALLEGATIONS ABOUT KILLINGS IN KABUGA.....	492
21. ALLEGATIONS ABOUT THE SONATUBE ‘INCIDENTS’.....	502
22. ALLEGATIONS ABOUT THE NYABYENDA INCIDENT.....	527
23. ALLEGATIONS ABOUT KILLINGS IN KICUKIRO AND SAHARA.....	533
24. ALLEGATIONS ABOUT KILLINGS AT RUHANGA CHURCH.....	537
25. ALLEGATIONS ABOUT THE IAMSEA INCIDENT.....	544
26. UTTERANCE OVER THE DEAD BODY OF PRIME MINISTER AGATHE.....	564
27. ALLEGATIONS ABOUT THE KILLINGS AT MASAKA.....	569
28. ALLEGATIONS RELATING TO KABGAYI HOSPITAL IN GITARAMA.....	577
MAY 21 – JULY 17, 1994.....	592
29. ALLEGATIONS ABOUT KILLINGS IN KABUSUNZU SECTOR.....	595
30. ALLEGATIONS ABOUT KILLINGS IN NYAKABANDA SECTOR.....	605
31. ALLEGATIONS ABOUT RWAMPARA INCIDENT.....	615
32. ALLEGATIONS ABOUT RAPE.....	624
33. ALLEGATION ABOUT REINFORCING INTERAHAMWE IN GITARAMA, KIBUYE AND NGORORERO.....	632
34. ALLEGATIONS ABOUT PLANNING OF GUERRILLA WARFARE.....	640
VII. ANALYSIS OF DNT EXHIBITS.....	643
VIII. CONCLUSION ON EVIDENCE.....	678
PART FOUR: RESPONSE TO THE PROSECUTION BRIEF.....	681
I. INTRODUCTION.....	681
II. DEFENSE RESPONSE TO PARAGRAPHS REFERRING TO MAJOR NTABAKUZE IN “CHAPTER IV” OF THE PROSECUTION BRIEF (IV. EVIDENCE ON VARIOUS COUNTS).....	682
III. DEFENSE RESPONSE TO PARAGRAPHS IN “CHAPTER V” OF THE PROSECUTION BRIEF REFERRING OR AFFECTING MAJ NTABAKUZE (V. EVIDENCE ON VARIOUS TOPICS).....	690
IV. DEFENCE RESPONSE TO SELECTED PARAGRAPHS REFERENCING SPECIFIC EXHIBITS IN “CHAPTER VI” OF THE PROSECUTION BRIEF (VI. EVIDENCE IN VARIOUS EXHIBITS).....	707
V. LIST OF EXCLUDED EVIDENCE INAPPROPRIATELY MENTIONED IN THE PROSECUTOR’S FINAL TRIAL BRIEF.....	713

PART FIVE: ANALYSIS OF THE PARAGRAPHS OF THE INDICTMENT WHICH PURPOTEDLY SUPPORT THE COUNTS714

I. THE CHARGES 714

II. ANALYSIS OF THE RELEVANT PARAGRAPHS OF THE INDICTMENT 716

A. PARAGRAPHS OF THE INDICTMENT PURPORTEDLY SUPPORTING COUNTS 1 TO 5 AND 7 TO 9 PURSUANT TO ARTICLE 6 (1)..... 716

Paragraph 4.6 of the Indictment: 716

Paragraph 4.7 of the Indictment: 716

Paragraph 4.8 of the Indictment: 717

Paragraph 5.1 of the Indictment: 717

Paragraph 5.5 of the Indictment: 719

Paragraph 5.8 of the Indictment: 720

Paragraph 5.10 of the Indictment: 721

Paragraph 5.16 of the Indictment: 722

Paragraph 5.17 of the Indictment: 723

Paragraph 5.22 of the Indictment: 724

Paragraph 6.7 of the Indictment: 725

Paragraph 6.8 of the Indictment: 725

Paragraph 6.18 of the Indictment: 728

Paragraph 6.24 of the Indictment: 729

Paragraph 6.27 of the Indictment: 730

Paragraph 6.28 of the Indictment: 732

Paragraph 6.29 of the Indictment: 733

Paragraph 6.30 of the Indictment: 733

Paragraph 6.31 of the Indictment: 733

Paragraph 6.46 of the Indictment: 734

Paragraph 6.49 of the Indictment: 735

Paragraph 6.50 of the Indictment: 735

Paragraph 6.51 of the indictment: 737

B. PARAGRAPHS OF THE INDICTMENT PURPORTEDLY SUPPORTING COUNTS 1 TO 5 AND 7 TO 9 PURSUANT TO RULE 6 (3) 738

Paragraph 5.33 of the Indictment: 738

Paragraph 5.34 of the Indictment: 738

Paragraph 5.35 of the Indictment: 738

Paragraph 5.36 of the Indictment: 739

Paragraph 6.8 of the Indictment: 741

Paragraph 6.15 of the Indictment: 743

Paragraph 6.16 of the Indictment: 744

Paragraph 6.18 of the Indictment: 744

Paragraph 6.19 of the Indictment: 746

Paragraph 6.32 of the Indictment: 747

Paragraph 6.33 of the Indictment: 748

Paragraph 6.34 of the Indictment: 749

Paragraph 6.35 of the Indictment: 750

Paragraph 6.36 of the Indictment: 750

Paragraph 6.37 of the indictment: 751

Paragraph 6.38 of the Indictment: 753

Paragraph 6.39 of the Indictment: 754

Paragraph 6.41 of the Indictment: 755

Paragraph 6.44 of the indictment: 755

Paragraph 6.45 of the Indictment: 756

Paragraph 6.47 of the indictment: 757

Paragraph 6.51 of the indictment: 758

C. PARAGRAPHS OF THE INDICTMENT PURPORTEDLY SUPPORTING COUNTS 6 AND 10 PURSUANT TO RULE 6 (3) 760

Paragraph 4.6 of the Indictment:	760
Paragraph 4.7 of the Indictment:	760
Paragraph 4.8 of the Indictment:	760
Paragraph 5.36 of the Indictment:	761
Paragraph 6.8 of the Indictment:	762
Paragraph 6.42 of the Indictment:	763
Paragraph 6.47 of the indictment:	764
III. CONCLUSION	766
PART SIX: THE COUNTS	767
COUNT 1: CONSPIRACY TO COMMIT GENOCIDE	767
COUNT 2: GENOCIDE	771
COUNT 3: COMPLICITY IN GENOCIDE	778
COUNT 4: CRIME AGAINST HUMANITY: MURDER	783
COUNT 5: CRIME AGAINST HUMANITY: EXTERMINATION	786
COUNT 7: CRIME AGAINST HUMANITY: PERSECUTION	791
COUNT 8: CRIME AGAINST HUMANITY: INHUMANE ACTS	793
COUNT 9: SERIOUS VIOLATION OF ARTICLE 3 COMMON TO THE GENEVA CONVENTIONS AND ADDITIONAL PROTOCOL II:	796
COUNT 10: SERIOUS VIOLATION OF ARTICLE 3 COMMON TO THE GENEVA CONVENTIONS AND ADDITIONAL PROTOCOL II:	798
PART SEVEN: SENTENCING ISSUES:	801
I. PRELIMINARY REMARK	801
II. THE GOOD CHARACTER OF THE ACCUSED	801
III. PREJUDICE CAUSED BY PRE-TRIAL PROCEEDINGS	802
PART EIGHT: GENERAL CONCLUSION	810
ANNEX: NTABAKUZE DEPOSITION IN SEPTEMBER 2006	811